

***THE STATUS OF PROVING ELECTRONIC LAND
CERTIFICATES BASED ON THE REGULATION OF THE
MINISTER OF ATR/BPN NUMBER 1 OF 2021
ABOUT ELECTRONIC CERTIFICATES***

Rafli Wahyu Albani

Faculty of Law, Universitas Malikussaleh
rafli.200510076@mhs.unimal.ac.id

Zainal Abidin

Faculty of Law, Universitas Malikussaleh
zainal@unimal.ac.id

Hasan Basri

Faculty of Law, Universitas Malikussaleh
hasan@unimal.ac.id

ABSTRACT

The danger that threatens physical land certificates is the reason for the birth of STE, the legal basis for STE is the Ministerial Regulation of ATR/BPN Number 1 of 2021 concerning Electronic Certificates. This study aims to find out the position of STE based on the Ministerial Regulation and the position of STE as evidence in court. The type of normative legal research, legal approach, conceptual approach, descriptive in nature, this research is in the form of an exploratory assessment. The results of this study show that the evidentiary position of STE based on the Minister of ATR/BPN Number 1 of 2021 is one of the ministerial regulations whose existence has been recognized, has binding legal force, this STE does not delete physical land certificates. The position of STE is equivalent to the position of physical land certificates. The evidentiary position of STE as evidence in court is based on the legal basis of STE, namely the Law and other regulations, the evidentiary position of STE in court is a recognized evidence (an extension of evidence in Indonesia), and has legal force as long as the process of issuing STE is carried out in accordance with the Ministerial Regulation of ATR/BPN Number 1 of 2021. Advice that can be given to the government and relevant authorities to continue to monitor and evaluate the land system which has now switched to electronic, because the increasingly advanced technology is accompanied by technological hackers who are increasingly prevalent, so to avoid that it is specifically for the authorized officials to continue to periodically check their security systems. The use of STE can be said to be the latest innovation in the land system, the authorized officials should also promote socialization to the community so that the public can know the changes in the current land system.

Keywords: *Electronic Land Certificate, Ministerial Regulation.*

1. INTRODUCTION

Land certificates have legal significance in Indonesia because they serve as an important document to determine ownership rights over land in the country (Ramadhani, R, 2021). This official document serves as tangible evidence of the rights of landowners as well as an important tool in safeguarding these rights. Although important, traditional methods of creating and preserving land physical certificates pose many obstacles. The vulnerability of these documents to fraud is a major concern that must be addressed. The threat of physical damage to land certificates should not be considered easy, as it can be caused by various sources (Wahyuni, R. D., & Misrah, 2023). There are times when severe damage to a document renders it completely unusable, requiring a long and expensive process to extend or replace it. In the absence of legal documents, the establishment of legal ownership of land becomes a challenge, and has the potential to trigger disputes and tensions among stakeholders (Wahyuni, R. D., & Misrah, 2023). Significant resource investments are essential to improve land administration systems, which may involve the implementation of advanced technologies such as Electronic Land Certificates (STEs). This will help address these issues and ensure that all stakeholders have a clearer legal framework to carry out their activities (Alam, and Aldani, 2023). The emergence and advancement of digital technology has brought great changes in various aspects of society, one of which is the solution of complex land administration problems. The use of digital technology presents new possibilities to overcome obstacles related to the creation, organization, and maintenance of land certificates. Within the framework of Indonesia, the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency (ATR/BPN) has implemented proactive steps through the issuance of Ministerial Regulation on ATR/BPN Number 1 of 2021 concerning Electronic Certificates, commonly known as "ATR/BPN Ministerial Regulation 1/2021" (Adinegoro, 2023).

The issues that will be discussed are: 1) what is the status of proving Electronic Land Certificates (STE) based on the Regulation of the Minister of ATR/BPN Number 1 of 2021? 2) what is the status of proving the Electronic Land Certificate (STE) as evidence in court? The objectives are: 1) to find out the evidentiary status of the Electronic Land Certificate (STE) based on the Regulation of the Minister of ATR/BPN Number 1 of 2021. 2) to find out the evidentiary position of the Electronic Land Certificate (STE) as evidence in court.

2. RESEARCH METHODS

The type of research is the process of investigation, collection, processing, analysis and presentation of data that is carried out systematically and objectively to solve a problem from an object being researched. This type of research uses normative legal research which includes the study of legal principles and norms through the examination of legal documents and the implementation of literature research (Tan, 2021). This type of legal research is often referred to as normative or doctrinal research because it only focuses on the analysis of written laws and legal documents. The approach in this study combines various methodologies, such as a legal approach, a conceptual approach, and a case approach, to explore the topic in depth and provide a comprehensive analysis (Faculty of Law, 2019).

This research is descriptive, which involves examining and describing various phenomena, both natural and man-made. This phenomenon can include various elements such as behavior, attributes, patterns, relationships, and differences between different events. This study utilizes several types of sources of legal materials which include 1). Primary legal materials refer to legal documents that have authoritative meanings, including basic principles such as Pancasila, the 1945 Constitution, laws and regulations, judicial precedents from the Supreme Court, and court decisions. In the context of this research, the primary legal material consists of the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia and regulations issued by government ministries. These materials serve as the foundation of the legal framework within which legal decisions and interpretations are made. The primary legal materials used are: Law Number 5 of 1960 concerning Agrarian Principles; Government Regulation Number 18 of 2021 concerning Management Rights, Land Rights, Flats, and Land Registration; Ministerial Regulation Number 1 of 2021 concerning Electronic Certificates. 2) Secondary legal materials are additional resources that are closely related to primary legal materials. These materials serve to provide further insight and interpretation of primary legal sources, such as proposed legislation, scientific analysis, and research findings. 3) Tertiary legal materials are sources that provide information about primary legal sources and secondary legal sources. This material includes legal dictionaries, bibliographies, and online resources such as websites and databases. They serve as a valuable tool for legal research and legal understanding (Soerjono Seokanto, 1984).

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. The Position of Electronic Land Certificate Proof Based on the Regulation of the Minister of ATR/BPN Number 1 of 2021 concerning Electronic Certificates

According to Article 1 number 8 of the Minister of ATR/BPN No. 1 of 2021, an electronic certificate is a certificate issued with a digital system which is then in the form of an electronic document, where *the tools* used in the issuance of this electronic certificate are electronic systems owned by the ministry. Some of the electronic system facilities owned by the ministry are Electronic Land Information (INTAN), Mitra/registered users within the Ministry (MITRA), applications related to HT-Elektronik), online certificate checking, SKPT-El issuance, Touch My Land, Bhumi (to view status information online), GISTARU (this is an application for *geographic information*), WBS ATR/BPN (application for *whistleblower system* where this application functions to report if there are indications of corruption crimes). LPSE ATR/BPN (this is an application for the procurement of goods/services within the Ministry). JDIH Legal Documentation and Information Network (website containing legal products) (Nizam Zakka and Muhammad Ali Fauzi, 2022).

As for Article 1 number 2 of the Ministerial Regulation of ATR/BPN, it is stated that an electronic document is any electronic information that is created, transmitted, transmitted, received, or stored in analog, digital, electronic, optical or similar form that can be seen, displayed, and/or heard through a computer or electronic system, including but not limited to writing, sound, images, maps, designs, photographs or the like, letters, signs, numbers, access codes, symbols or perforations that have meanings that can be understood by people who are able to understand them.

As previously described related to the legal basis that can be used as a foothold for STE, it can be known that the Ministerial Regulation of ATR/BPN Number 1 of 2021 concerning Electronic Certificates is one of the laws and regulations or rather a ministerial regulation whose existence has been recognized, of course, this has binding legal force but with 2 (two) conditions, namely "ordered by a higher Legislation or formed based on authority". Looking at the consideration of this ministerial regulation which refers to the UUPA, then the implementing regulations are related and also based on the ITE Law and the Job Creation Law, it can be concluded that the Ministerial Regulation of ATR/BPN Number 1 of 2021 concerning Electronic Certificates was formed based on higher regulatory orders (UUPA and ITE Law), which then shows the basis of the minister's authority to make a regulation

that is felt to be able to help the government as one of the assistant to the president (Harsono Boedi, 2009).

Given that the Ministry of ATR/BPN is authorized in the field of national land, it can be said that the Ministry of ATR/BPN has an attribute authority, namely the authority that has been determined, which means that it is binding. In other words, after the regulation issued by the ministry, in this case the Regulation of the Minister of ATR/BPN Number 1 of 2021 concerning Electronic Certificates, as long as the process follows in accordance with the procedures of the Ministerial Regulation, it has legal force.

Legal protection for a person who is a certificate holder of land in Article 95 of Government Regulation Number 18 of 2021 concerning Management Rights, Land Rights, Flats, and Land Registration states that if within 5 (five) years from the issuance of the certificate and no one objects, the certificate is valid as belonging to him and the validity of the certificate cannot be challenged again. Thus, as can be seen, the certificate is recognized as an authentic deed, and has strong evidentiary power. Then because of the times that continue to advance and develop, as well as the technology that now exists and is known as STE, based on the ITE Law, other laws and regulations, STE has the same status as physical land certificates.

The existence of this STE does not remove the function of the physical land certificate where both have the same status, and can be valid evidence of the land. Where this is in accordance with Government Regulation Number 18 of 2021 concerning Management Rights, Land Rights, Flats and Land Registration, which is a follow-up to Article 142 and Article 185 letter b of the Job Creation Law, and other laws and regulations.

The conclusion that the author can provide with the explanation and legal basis above is that the Electronic Certificate issued by the Ministry of ATR/BPN has a valid evidentiary position and can be used as evidence as long as the process of obtaining the STE is in accordance with the procedures that have been set by the Minister of ATR/BPN Number 1 of 2021 concerning the Electronic Certificate.

B. The Status of Electronic Land Certificate Proof as Evidence in Court

Basically, the electronic land registration mechanism must still be based on analog land registration, besides that for the physical and juridical data of the land that will be used as the issuance of STE will not be destroyed but will be scanned which will then be stored in digital format. Through this STE, it is hoped that it will make it easier for all community members who have land rights to register land, it also needs to be emphasized that it must

be in accordance with the guidelines in the provisions related to land registration as regulated in the Ministerial Regulation of ATR/BPN No.1/2021.

Wahyudi argued that for the stage of proof in court, there are 2 (two) elements that play an important role, namely: first, the parties must have valid evidence according to the law of proof, second, the evidence must be in accordance with the principle of proof in the civil procedure law which provides valid grounds for a lawsuit or rebuttal (Johan, 2012). In addition, Yusandy said that the proof has a very important role in the outcome of the verdict later, because the arguments of the parties will be tested through the evidentiary stage with the aim that the judge can determine which law to use or find the law in adjudicating a case (Trio Yusandy, 2019).

The strength of the electronic certificate is also based on the ITE Law, especially in Article 5 paragraph (2) stating that electronic information and/or electronic documents and/or printed results are an extension of valid legal evidence in accordance with the applicable procedural law in the State of Indonesia, then when STE is valid evidence based on laws and regulations, it is included in authentic evidence even though it is in electronic form.

This electronic certificate contains one of them, electronic signatures, although in Indonesia it has not been clearly regulated related to the definition of signatures, but as discussed above, actually the signature has 2 (two) basic functions, namely as the identity of the signer and also as a sign of agreement from the signer on the obligations in certain deeds (Ismail, 2011).

Article 85 of Government Regulation No. 18/2021 states that for the purpose of proving in court and/or providing land information is requested, data and/or documents can be accessed through an electronic system. The ITE Law also states that electronic documents are equivalent to documents made on paper. Yusandy said that in civil cases, the power of electronic proof is equated with written evidence, although the mechanism for submitting documents to the court is not regulated in detail.

Then if it is equated with a criminal case in Article 184 of the Criminal Procedure Code based on the previous description, it can be concluded that this STE can be categorized as letter evidence (expansion of evidence) which can be accepted by the court, recognized its existence and considered valid as long as it is through legal procedures and follows existing regulations.

To complete that this STE can be used as one of the evidence, it is also necessary to legalize it with an electronic signature, this is based on the Minister of ATR/BPN Regulation No. 1/2021 Article 1 number 5 which states that an electronic signature is a signature

consisting of electronic information that is attached, associated (related) with other electronic information that can be used as a verification and authentication tool. Then Article 4 of this Ministerial Regulation stipulates that this signing must be done by an authorized official, so that the TTD has a meaning and aims to make a document valid. Thus, if the process and ratification are appropriate, this STE will have legal force and legal consequences.

Drawing conclusions from the above description, the position of STE as evidence in court is legally recognized, if seen in the proof of criminal proceedings then this STE will be included as extended evidence (letter) even though it is in electronic form and if seen in the proof of civil proceedings then this STE will be included as letter evidence, although the submission process has not been clearly and clearly regulated but in fact this electronic evidence has been recognized and used in trials. Then the STE used as evidence, in addition to being recognized in court, is also binding and has legal force as long as the STE issued is in accordance with the regulations determined by the Minister of ATR/BPN Number 1 of 2021 concerning Electronic Certificates.

4. CONCLUSION

The position of proof of STE based on the Regulation of the Minister of ATR/BPN Number 1 of 2021 concerning Electronic Certificates is one of the laws and regulations or rather a ministerial regulation whose existence has been recognized, of course, this has binding legal force, the position of the Minister of ATR/BPN No. 1 of 2021 is equivalent to a Government Regulation, which means that the position of the Minister of ATR/BPN No. 1 of 2021 has the same legal force as the regulation Other. The existence of this STE does not delete the physical land certificate, but the existing physical land certificate will be *scanned* and then stored in digital form. The position of the electronic land certificate is equivalent (equal) to the position of the physical land certificate.

The position of STE as evidence in court is based on the legal basis of STE, namely the Basic Agrarian Law, the Information and Electronic Law, the Job Creation Law, and other regulations, so hereby the position of STE proof in court is a recognized evidence (if seen in the proof of civil proceedings, STE is an extension of written evidence from the judicial system that is recognized in Indonesia, then if seen in the proof of criminal proceedings, the STE is an expansion of the letter evidence, although the submission process as evidence is not clearly regulated, but in practice this electronic evidence has been accepted and recognized in the trial), besides that, it can be said that this STE already has legal force as

long as the process of issuing the STE is carried out in accordance with applicable regulations (Permen ATR/BPN Number 1 of 2021 concerning Certificates Electronic.

To the government and relevant authorities to continue to supervise and evaluate the land system which has now switched to electronic systems, due to the development of science and technology accompanied by the increasingly rampant hacking of technology and communication systems, so to avoid that it is special for the authorized officials to continue to periodically check, and evaluate the STE security system. The use of STE can be said to be the latest innovation in the existing land system in Indonesia, officials who are authorized to organize socializations to the community so that the public can know the changes in the current land system and can accept it as a form of change from the existing land system, and it is hoped that the community can also implement STE.

To the Indonesian people who are already aware of the land system that has changed to an electronic system, they should immediately change the physical land certificate to STE by following the procedures that have been set by the Minister of ATR/BPN Number 1 of 2021 concerning Electronic Certificates, where for those who already have a certificate to come to BPN to do *the scanning* process. The physical certificate of the land to then be stored in digital form, for those who have not registered the land, the process will be directly carried out by the authorized officials to do everything online which in the final process will be the issuance of the STE, with the existence of this STE it is hoped that the community, officials and public services will be easier and more comfortable.

5. REFERENCE

Adinegoro, Challenges in the Implementation of Electronic Land Certificates at the Ministry of Agrarian and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency of the Republic of Indonesia, *Journal of Notary Science*, 2023, Vol. 4, No. 2, pp. 130-132.

Alam, and Aldani, Legal Certainty of Land Registration Through PPAT Officials Online Using the Ministry of Agrarian and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency (BPN) Application, *Journal of Scientific Research*, 2023, Vol. 2, No. 9, pp. 3579-3581.

Faculty of Law, Malikussaleh University, Final Project Writing Guidebook, Lhokseumawe, 2019, p. 12.

Harsono Boedi, Indonesian Agrarian Law, Association of Land Law Regulations, Djambatan, Jakarta, 2009, p. 115.

Ismail, Certificate as Evidence of Land Rights in the Judicial Process, *Journal of Legal Sciences*, 2011, No. 53, p. 35.

Johan Wahyudi, Electronic Documents as Evidence in Evidence in Court, Perspective Journal, 2012, Vol. 17, No. 2, p. 120.

Nizam Zakka Arrizal and Muhammad Ali Fauzi, Legal Aspects of Electronic Certificates in the Land Registration System in Indonesia, Legal Scientific Journal, 2022, Vol. 9, No. 1, p. 96.

Nur Hidayani Alimuddin, Implementation of Electronic Certificates as a Guarantee of Legal Certainty of Land Rights Ownership in Indonesia, Journal of Legal Sciences, 2021, Vol. 27, No. 3, p. 345.

Ramadhani, R, Land Registration as a Step to Obtain Legal Certainty on Land Rights, Journal of Social and Economic Affairs, Journal of Social and Economic Affairs, 2021, Vol. 2, No. 1, pp. 31-32.

Soerjono Soekanto, Introduction to Legal Research, University of Indonesia Press, Jakarta, 1984, p. 10.

Tan, Legal Research Methods: Exploring and Exploring Methodologies in Conducting Legal Research, Nusantara: Journal of Social Sciences, 2021, Vol. 8, No. 8, p. 2465.

Trio Yusandy, The Position and Power of Evidentiary of Electronic Evidence in Civil Procedure Law in Indonesia, Journal of Serambi Akademica, 2019, Vol. 7, No. 4, p. 1522.

Wahyuni, R. D., & Misrah, Government Policies in Efforts to Prevent and Eradicate the Land Mafia, Journal of Initiation, 2023, Vol. 12, No. 1, pp. 25-30.

6. BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. Book

Lanka, Asmar, and Samsul Fadli, Legal Discovery Method, UII Press First Edition, Yogyakarta, 2019.

Ardiansyah, Defense Legal Policy, Deepublish, Yogyakarta, 2022.

Boedi, H. Indonesian Agrarian Law, Association of Land Law Regulations, Djambatan, Jakarta, 2009.

Koesparmono, Irsan, and Armansyah, A Guide to Understanding the Law of Proof in Civil Law and Criminal Law, Gramanata Publishing, Bekasi, 2019.

Muhaimin, Legal Research Methods, Mataram University Press, Mataram, 2020.

Syahrum, M. Introduction to Legal Research Methodology: Normative Research Studies, Empirical, Proposal Writing, Thesis Reports and Thesis. 2022.

Faculty of Law, Malikussaleh University, Final Project Writing Guidebook, Lhokseumawe, 2019.

Wahyuni, et al., Reflection on the Year-End of the 2021 Umsida Academics Recording Traces of Wisdom at the End of the Pandemic Period, Umsida Press, Surabaya, 2023.

B. Laws and Regulations

Government Regulation Number 18 of 2021 concerning Management Rights, Land Rights, Flats, and Land Registration.

Decision of Civil Case at the Mimika Religious Court Number: 66/Pdt.G/2023/PA. Mmk on July 17, 2023.

Criminal Case Decision at the Central Jakarta District Court Number: 777/Pid.B/2016/PN. JKT PST dated October 24, 2016.

Republic of Indonesia, Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia 1945.

Republic of Indonesia, Law Number 11 of 2020 concerning Job Creation.

Republic of Indonesia, Law Number 19 of 2016 concerning Information and Electronic Transactions.

Republic of Indonesia, Law Number 5 of 1960 concerning Agrarian Principles.

C. Journals and Online Publications

Adinegoro, 2023, *Challenges in the Implementation of Electronic Land Certificates at the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency of the Republic of Indonesia*, Journal of Notary Science, Vol. 4, No. 2.

Agustina, E, 2021, *Juridical Study of the Electronic Land Rights Certificate Issuance Program*, Journal of Solutions, Vol. 19, No. 3.

Aldani, Alam, 2023, *Legal Certainty of Land Registration Through PPAT Officials Online Using the Ministry of Agrarian and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency (BPN) Application*, Journal of Scientific Research, Vol. 2, No. 9.

Alimuddin, Nur Hidayani, 2021, *Implementation of Electronic Certificates as a Guarantee of Legal Certainty of Land Rights Ownership in Indonesia*, Journal of Legal Sciences, Vol. 27, No. 3.

Allagan, Destriana, 2022, *The Role of Land Deed Making Officials in Land Administration through Electronic Land Certificates*, Journal of PALAR (Pakuan Law Review), Vol. 8, No. 1.

Amrin, 2023, *The Urgency of Resolving Land Cases Through Electronic Mediation in the Era of Disruption*, Journal of Land, Vol. 13, No. 1.

Anwar, Nur Syamsi, 2019, *Analysis of Digital Transactions of Cryptocurrency as a Global Invention in the Perspective of Islamic Law*, Thesis, Faculty of Islamic Religion, University of Muhammadiyah, Makassar.

- Ardani, 2022, *The Problem of Land Administration Order through Fair Land Registration Activities*, Indonesian Journal of Legal Development, Vol.4, No. 3.
- Arrizal, Nizam Zakka, and Muhammad Ali Fauzi, 2022, *Legal Aspects of Electronic Certificates in the Land Registration System in Indonesia*, Legal Scientific Journal, Vol. 9, No. 1.
- Assidiqih, Gandi, 2022, *Juridical Review of Electronic Land Certificates as Proof of Land Ownership in Indonesia*, Journal of the Faculty of Social Sciences and Law, State University of Surabaya, Vol. 1, No. 2.
- B, Prasetyo, D. & Saefudin, A, 2023, *Digitalization of Land Service Innovation: Online Certificate Checking at the Purbalingga Regency Land Office*, Land Journal, Vol. 13, No. 1.
- B, Suharto, & Supadno, S, 2023, *Obstacles in the Implementation of the Complete Systematic Land Registration Program (PTSL)*, The Indonesian Journal of Public Administration, Vol. 9, No. 1.
- Dewi, et al., 2023, *The Legal Power of Digital Signatures in Proving Civil Disputes According to Law Number 11 of 2008 concerning Information and Electronic Transactions*, Scientific Journal of Raad Kertha, Vol. 6, No. 2.
- idtesis.com, <https://idtesis.com/penelitian-hukum-dikelompokkan-berdasar-sifat-dan-focus-study/>, Accessed on May 1, 2024.
- Fadhly, Bayukri, 2022, *Analysis of the Implementation of Online-Based Public Services in the Modern Revolution at the Office of the National Land Agency (BPN) of Nagan Raya Regency*, Journal of Research and Community Service, Vol. 1, No. 9.
- Febrianti, 2021, *Legal Protection for Electronic Land Rights Certificate Holders*, Indonesian Notary, Vol. 2, No. 3.
- The Elmo Ra'is Cluster, *Still Has Our Country's Morals, Pro Legal*, Website, <http://www.prolegalnews.id/m/Menu-Berita/Opini/Masih-Punya-Moralkah-Aparat-Penegak-Hukum-Kita-.htm>. Accessed on March 8, 2024.
- Handayani, Apik, and Reni Anggriani, 2022, *Digital Transformation of Land Certificates by PPAT in Kulon Progo Regency*, Journal of the University of Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Vol. 2 No. 1.
- Hidayat, A. 2021, *Critical Review of the Book "Legal Research" Peter Mahmud Marzuki Ad Quem Legal Research on Norms*, Legal Scientific Journal, Vol. 7, No. 2.
- Ismail, 2011, *Certificate as Evidence of Land Rights in the Judicial Process*, Journal of Legal Sciences, No. 53.
- The Great Dictionary of Indonesian, *Definition of Signatures*, <https://kbbi.web.id/tandatangan>, accessed July 17, 2024.
- Liviani, Habibi, 2023, *Information Technology Crime (Cyber Crime) and Its Countermeasures in the Indonesian Legal System*, *Al-Qanun*, Journal of Islamic Legal Thought and Renewal, Vol. 23, No. 2.

- Mujiburohman, Andari, 2023, *Legal Aspects of Electronic Land Certificate Services*, *Al-Adl: Law Journal*, Vol. 15, No.1.
- Mulyani, Basri, Hairun Maksun and Johan, 2021, *Development of Community Legal Awareness through Legal Awareness Villages in East Lombok Regency*, *Journal of the Faculty of Law, Gunung Rinjani University*, Vol. 2, No. 2.
- Musyarofah, Ramadhani, 2024, *Realization of the Complete Systematic Land Registration Policy (PTSL) as an Effort to Accelerate Land Registration at the Jember Regency Land Office*, *Gudang Jurnal Multidisciplinary Ilmu*, Vol. 2, No.2.
- Myrna, Bahtiar, R., & Susanti, E, 2021, *Digital Government in Motor Vehicle Tax Payment Based on the SAMSAT Mobile West Java Application (SAMBARA) in West Java*, *Journal of Public Administration*, Vol. 7, No. 2.
- N, Ikhsanto, F, & Rahmawati, D. E, 2024, *The Use of Instagram as a Government Communication Media in the Socialization of Passport Making Procedures: Class 1 Immigration Office TPI Yogyakarta*, *Journal of Government Science*, Vol. 5, No. 2.
- Nafan, M, 2022, *Legal Certainty on the Application of Electronic Certificates as Evidence of Land Rights Control in Indonesia*, *Tabusai Education Journal*, Vol. 6, No. 1.
- Nafisah, 2023, *The Legal Validity of Electronic Certificates in Land Ownership Based on the Regulation of the Minister of Agrarian and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency Number 1 of 2021 concerning Electronic Certificates*, *Journal of Scientific Dynamics of Law*, Vol. 28, No. 3.
- Novita, 2022, *Legal Policy of the Ministry of ATR/BPN on the Prevention of Land Mafia in the Basis of the Implementation of the Land Registration System*, Thesis, Doctoral dissertation, Sultan Agung Islamic University, Semarang.
- Q, Jaelani, A. & Munawaroh, S, 2023, *The Application of Land Registration at Land Offices in the Surabaya City Area*, *Journal of Law and Justice*, Vol. 12, No. 1.
- Rachman, Muhammad Insany, and Evi Dwi Hastri, 2021, *Analysis of Obstacles to the Implementation of the Regulation of the Minister of ATR / Head of BPN Number 1 of 2021 concerning Electronic Certificates*, *Journal of the University of Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta*, Vol. 6, No. 2.
- Ramadhani, R, 2021, *Land Registration as a Step to Obtain Legal Certainty on Land Rights*, *Journal of Social and Economic Affairs*, 2021, Vol. 2, No. 1.
- Renandra, Tetama Androvaga, 2023, *Legal Politics of Electronic Land Registration After the Job Creation Law*, *Journal of Tunas Agraria*, Vol. 6, No. 1.
- Sapardiyono and Sukmi Pinuji, 2022, *Consistency of Legal Protection of Ownership and Land Rights through Electronic Land Certificates*, *Journal of Widya Bhumi*, Vol. 2, No. 1.
- Setiawan, Ahmad Budi, 2021, *The Ecosystem for the Implementation of Electronic Certificates in Electronic Commerce Systems*, *Journal of Communication and Informatics*, Vol. 6, No. 2.

- Setyadji, Maghfiroh, 2023, *Legal Consequences in Forging Letters for Land Crimes in Land Registration*, Bureaucracy Journal Indonesia Journal of Law and Social Political Governance, Vol. 3, No. 1.
- Shella, Shella Aniscasary and Risti Dwi Ramasari, 2022, *Juridical Review of the Legal Strength of Electronic Land Certificates Based on the Regulation of the Minister of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning Number 1 of 2021*, Journal of Health Law and Ethics, Vol. 2, No. 1.
- Sihombing, 2021, *Procurement of the Smart Family Vital Archive Online Application (Arvigadas) by the Government as a Means of Preventing Land Disputes in the Community After a Disaster*, Journal of Archives, Vol. 16, No. 2.
- Silviana, Ana, 2021, *The Urgency of Electronic Land Certificates in the Land Registration Legal System in Indonesia*, Administration Law & Government Journal, Vol. 4, No. 1.
- Slamet, Titi S. and Marianne Masako Palilig, 2019, *The Legal Force of Transactions and Electronic Signatures in Agreements*, Paulus Law Journal, Vol. 1, No. 1.
- Sukman, 2022, *The Power of Proof of De Auditu Witnesses in the Perspective of Criminal Procedural Law in Indonesia*, Legal Scientific Journal, Vol. 28, No. 6.
- Sulma, Khairatus, 2022, *The Familiarity of Electronic Signatures and Their Proof Strength in Civil Procedure Law*, Journal of the Faculty of Law, Malikussaleh University, Vol. 5, No. 3.
- Syamsur, and Andi Tira, 2023, *Analysis of Obstacles to the Implementation of Electronic Certificates and Efforts to Solve Them in Makassar City*, Indonesian Journal of Legality of Law, Vol. 6, No. 1.
- Tan, 2021, *Legal Research Methods: Exploring and Reviewing Methodologies in Conducting Legal Research*, Nusantara: Journal of Social Sciences, Vol. 8, No.8.
- Tarigan, 2021, *Legal Consequences of Electronic Signatures of Digital Documents in Civil Proof*, Rechten Journal: Legal Research and Human Rights, Vol. 3, No. 3.
- Wahyudi, Johan, 2012, *Electronic Documents as Evidence in Proof in Court*, Perspective Journal, Vol. 17, No. 2.
- Wahyudi, Johan, 2020, *Electronic Documents as Evidence in Evidence in Court*, Journal of the Faculty of Law, Universitas Airlangga, Vol. 17, No. 2.
- Wahyuni, R. D., & Misrah, 2023, *Government Policies in Efforts to Prevent and Eradicate the Land Mafia*, Journal of Initiation, Vol. 12, No. 1.
- Wiryan, Laura Helena, 2021, *SWOT Analysis of Electronic Certificates on Land Dispute Resolution in Indonesia*, Agama Law Journal, Vol. 4, No. 2.
- Yusandy, Trio, 2019, *The Position and Power of Evidentiary of Electronic Evidence in Civil Procedure Law in Indonesia*, Journal of Serambi Akademica, Vol. 7, No. 4.